Exhibit 4

to

Memorandum of Law in Support of United States' Motion to Consolidate Cases for Trial

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

IN RE PHARMACEUTICAL INDUSTRY AVERAGE WHOLESALE PRICE LITIGATION MDL No. 1456 Master File No. 01-CV-12257-PBS Subcategory Case No. 06-CV-11337-PBS

Magistrate Judge Marianne B. Bowler

Judge Patti B. Saris

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:

United States of America ex rel. Ven-A-Care of) the Florida Keys, Inc., et al. v. Boehringer) Ingelheim Corporation, et al., Civil Action No.) 07-10248-PBS

DEFENDANTS ROXANE LABORATORIES, INC., n/k/a BOEHRINGER INGELHEIM ROXANE, INC.'S AND ROXANE LABORATORIES, INC.'S SUPPLEMENTAL INITIAL DISCLOSURES PURSUANT TO FED. R. CIV. P. RULE 26

Roxane Laboratories, Inc., n/k/a Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane, Inc. and Roxane Laboratories, Inc. (collectively "Roxane")¹ make the following supplemental initial disclosures pursuant to Rule 26 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Local Rule 26.2(A):

_

These separate corporate entities are providing these joint Disclosures because they are products of a recent corporate reorganization. In April 2005, Roxane Laboratories, Inc., a Delaware corporation, changed its name to Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane, Inc ("BIRI"). BIRI remains a Delaware corporation. BIRI continues to manufacture pharmaceutical products. Also in April 2005, a new corporation, Roxane Laboratories, Inc. ("RLI"), was incorporated in Nevada. As of that time, the new Nevada corporation assumed responsibilities for sales and marketing of multi-source pharmaceutical products sold under the Roxane trade name. Because the focus of this suit is on the sale and marketing of Roxane products, for the purpose of this Response, all responses regarding the time period before April 2005 will be deemed to have been made on behalf of RLI.

(A) The name and, if known, the address and telephone number of each individual likely to have discoverable information that the disclosing party may use to support its claims or defenses, unless solely for impeachment, identifying the subjects of the information.

RESPONSE:

Roxane's investigation into the facts and circumstances surrounding this action and other AWP cases is not yet complete. Roxane accordingly bases this Response on the information presently within its possession and reserves the right to supplement or amend this Response as appropriate and to the extent required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Subject to the foregoing, Roxane herein discloses the following current and former Roxane employees, who may have knowledge of relevant facts and circumstances because of their role in, or familiarity with, the pricing and/or marketing of Roxane's products, the reporting and/or determination of prices and pricing benchmarks, and/or the calculation of AMP:

| Name | Address and Telephone Number | Specific Subject(s) of Information |
|-------------|--|--|
| Joe DeCapua | Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 900 Ridgebury Road P.O. Box 368 Ridgefield, CT 06877-0368 Ph: (203) 798-9988 | Medicaid rebates; the calculation of AMP and Best Price for Roxane products. |
| Mike Doan | 1436 Chadwick Ridge Drive Lawrenceville, GA 30043 Ph: Not Available | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies. |

| Name | Address and Telephone Number | Specific Subject(s) of Information |
|---------------------|--|---|
| Richard Feldman | 14 Island Rock Plymouth, MA 02360 Ph: Not Available | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies; pricing of Roxane products; communications with pricing compendia. |
| Dawn Gordon | Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 900 Ridgebury Road P.O. Box 368 Ridgefield, CT 06877-0368 Ph: (203) 798-9988 | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies. |
| Christine Marsh | Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 900 Ridgebury Road P.O. Box 368 Ridgefield, CT 06877-0368 Ph: (203) 798-9988 | Contract administration for Roxane products. |
| Lesli Paoletti | Roxane Laboratories, Inc. 300 Northfield Road Bedford, OH 44146 Ph: (800) 562-4797 | Pricing and marketing of Roxane products. |
| John Powers | 6054 Hampton Corners North Hilliard, OH 43206 Ph: Not Available | Contract administration for Roxane products. |
| James Rowenhorst | Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 900 Ridgebury Road P.O. Box 368 Ridgefield, CT 06877-0368 Ph: (203) 798-9988 | Eligibility of Roxane products for third-party reimbursement. |
| Steve Snyder | Ben Venue Laboratories, Inc. 300 Northfield Road Bedford, OH 44146 Ph: (800) 562-4797 | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies. |

| Name | Address and Telephone Number | Specific Subject(s) of Information |
|---------------------|--|--|
| Robert Sykora | 6340 Sugarloaf Parkway Suite 400 Duluth, Georgia 30097 Ph: Not Available | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies. |
| Anthony Tavolaro | Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 900 Ridgebury Road P.O. Box 368 Ridgefield, CT 06877-0368 Ph: (203) 798-9988 | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies. |
| Edward J. Tupa | P.O. Box 1094 Granby, CO 80446 Ph: Not Available | Pricing, marketing, and/or sale of Roxane products. |
| Tom Via | Boehringer Ingelheim Pharmaceuticals, Inc. 900 Ridgebury Road P.O. Box 368 Ridgefield, CT 06877-0368 Ph: (203) 798-9988 | Marketing and/or sale of Roxane products to wholesalers and pharmacies; contracting between Roxane and wholesalers; contracting between Roxane and pharmacies. |
| Judy Waterer | Roxane Laboratories, Inc. 300 Northfield Road Bedford, OH 44146 Ph: (800) 562-4797 | Pricing and marketing of Roxane products. |

Roxane does not disclose herein the names of inside or outside counsel whose knowledge of relevant facts and circumstances relate only to their activities in providing legal advice and therefore is protected by the attorney-client privilege. Current and former Roxane employees, including those listed above, should be contacted exclusively through counsel for Roxane:

Helen E. Witt, P.C.

Anne M. Sidrys, P.C.

Eric T. Gortner

Kirkland & Ellis LLP

200 E. Randolph Drive

Chicago, IL 60601

(312) 861-2000 (Telephone)

(312) 861-2200 (Facsimile)

Roxane further states that current and former employees, representatives, and/or officials

of the following entities are likely to have discoverable information in this case: branches,

agencies, and departments of the federal government, including, but not limited to the

Department of Health and Human Services ("HHS"), the Office of the Inspector General

("OIG"), and the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services ("CMS"), f/k/a Health Care

Financing Administration ("HCFA"); Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. ("Ven-A-Care");

State health care agencies, including, but not limited to the Medicaid agencies for each of the

fifty states; independent pricing compendia publishers, including, but not limited to First Data

Bank; and wholesalers for pharmaceutical products, including, but not limited to

AmerisourceBergen and McKesson. The identities of many of the individuals referenced above

are best known to Plaintiffs. Notwithstanding, Roxane herein discloses the following current and

former employees, representatives, and/or officials of the entities referenced above, who are

likely to have discoverable information that will support some or all of Roxane's defenses:

HHS - OIG

Linda Boone Abbott

Office of Evaluation and Inspections 7500 Security Boulevard

Baltimore, MD 21244

(410) 786-4662

5

June Gibbs Brown

7306 Bloomsbury Lane Spotsylvania, VA 22553

Patricia Davis

Director, Medicare and Medicaid Unit Office of Evaluation and Inspections 7500 Security Boulevard Baltimore, MD 21244-1850 (410) 786-3148

George F. Grob

330 Independence Ave., S.W., Room 5660 Washington, DC 20201

Cynthia Hansford

Program Assistant Office of Evaluation and Inspections 150 S. Independence Mall West Public Ledger Building, Room 356 Philadelphia, PA 19106 (215) 861-4549

Nancy J. Molyneaux

Program Analyst Office of Evaluation and Inspections 150 S. Independence Mall West Public Ledger Building, Room 356 Philadelphia, PA 19106-9111 (215) 861-4544

Linda M. Ragone

Deputy Regional Inspector General Office of Evaluation and Inspections 150 S. Independence Mall West Public Ledger Building, Room 356 Philadelphia, PA 19106-9111 (215) 861-4561

George M. Reeb

Assistant Inspector General, CMS 7500 Security Boulevard, Room N2-25-26 Baltimore, MD 21244-1850 (410) 786-7104

Janet Rehnquist

Former Inspector General The Rehnquist Group, PLLC 1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W., 4th Floor Washington, D.C. 20036 (202) 715-8536

Amy Sernyak

44 Spring House Lane Media, PA 19063

Donna E. Shalala

President, University of Miami 230 Ashe Building Coral Gables, FL 33124 (305) 284-2211

Lisa Foley Stand

(Current address unknown)

David Tawes

Director Medicare and Medicaid Pricing Unit Office of Evaluation and Inspections 150 S. Independence Mall West Public Ledger Building, Room 356 Philadelphia, PA 19106-9111 (215) 861-4552

Robert A. Vito

Regional Inspector General for Evaluation and Inspections, Philadelphia 150 S. Independence Mall West Public Ledger Building Philadelphia, PA 19106-9111 (215) 861-4546

Stuart Wright

330 Independence Ave., SW, Room 5272A Washington, DC 20201 (202) 619-0480

CMS - HCFA

Thomas A. Ault

Partner, Health Policy Alternatives 400 North Capitol St. N.W., Suite 799 Washington, D.C. 20001 (202) 737-3390

Charles Booth

Former Director of Financial Services Office of Finance Management 8024 Ridgley Oak Drive Baltimore, MD 21234

Ira Burney

200 Independence Ave., S.W. Humphrey Building, Room 355G-04 Washington, D.C. 20201 (202) 690-7600

Kathleen Buto

Vice President for Health Policy, Government Affairs Johnson & Johnson (202) 589-1000

Frank J. Camozzi

HCFA Region IX 90 7th Street, Suite 5-300 (5W) San Francisco, CA 94103 (415) 744-3646

Debbie Chang

Deputy Secretary for Health Care Financing Maryland Department of Health & Mental Hygiene 201 West Preston Street Baltimore, MD 21201 (410) 767-4664

Nancy-Ann Min DeParle

15 Everett Street 2 Cambridge, MA 02138

T. Randolf Graydon

(Current address unknown)

Tom Gustafson

(Current address unknown)

Louis B. Hays

19 Cornfield Lane Madison, CT 06443

Thomas Hoyer

Center for Beneficiary Choices 7500 Security Boulevard Baltimore, MD 21244-1850

Rubin King-Shaw Jr.

Former Deputy Administrator and Chief Operating Officer (Current address unknown)

Lawrence L. McDonough

HCFA Region IX (Current address unknown)

Michael McMullan

7500 Security Blvd., Room C5-18, 27 Baltimore, MD 21244-1850 (410) 786-4280

Richard Morris

(Current address unknown)

Robert Niemann

(Current address unknown) (410) 786-4531

John J. O'Hara

HCFA Region IX (Current address unknown)

Bernard ("Bernie") Patashnik

(Current address unknown)

Larry Reed

7500 Security Boulevard Baltimore, MD 21244 (410) 786-3000

Vickie Robey

7500 Security Boulevard, Room SL-13-12 Baltimore, MD 21244-1850 (410) 786-7883

Thomas A. Scully

Senior Counsel, Alston & Bird, LLP The Atlantic Building 950 F Street, NW Washington, DC 20004-1404 (202) 756-3459

Dennis G. Smith

Director Virginia Department of Medical Assistance Services 600 East Broad Street, Suite 1300 Richmond, VA 23219 (804) 786-7933

William Toby

(Current address unknown)

Dr. Bruce C. Vladeck

Former HCFA Administrator 360 West 36th Street New York, NY 10018

Stanley Weintraub

(Current address unknown) (410) 786-4498

Gail R. Wilensky

Senior Fellow, Project HOPE 601 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 900 South Building Washington, DC 20004 (202) 220-3082 (301) 656-7401

Federal Legislators

Sen. Charles Ernest Grassley

135 Hart Senate Building Washington, D.C. 20510-1501 (202) 224-3744

Rep. Fortney Pete Stark

39300 Civic Center Dr., Suite 220 Fremont, CA 94538 (510) 494-1388

Government Counsel

George B. Henderson, II

Assistant U.S. Attorney United States Department of Justice John Joseph Moakley U.S. Courthouse 1 Courthouse Way, Suite 9200 Boston, Massachusetts 02210

Mark A. Lavine

Special Assistant U.S. Attorney 99 N.E. 4th Street, 3rd Floor Miami, FL 33132

Mary E. Riordan

Senior Counsel
Office of Counsel for the Inspector General
U.S. Department of Health and Human Services
330 Independence Avenue, SW
Cohen Building, Room 5527
Washington, DC 20201

Ven-A-Care

Zachary T. Bentley

Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. c/o James J. Breen The Breen Law Firm, P.A. 5755 Northpoint Parkway, Suite 39 Alpharetta, GA 30022 (770) 740-0008

John Calleja

(Current address unknown)

Luis E. Cobo

Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. c/o James J. Breen The Breen Law Firm, P.A. 5755 Northpoint Parkway, Suite 39 Alpharetta, GA 30022 (770) 740-0008

T. Mark Jones

Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. c/o James J. Breen The Breen Law Firm, P.A. 5755 Northpoint Parkway, Suite 39 Alpharetta, GA 30022 (770) 740-0008

John Lockwood

Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. c/o James J. Breen The Breen Law Firm, P.A. 5755 Northpoint Parkway, Suite 39 Alpharetta, GA 30022 (770) 740-0008

First DataBank

Ed Edelstein

(Current address unknown)

Joseph L. Hirschmann

(Current address unknown)

Patricia Kay Morgan

c/o Gold Standard 302 Knights Run Avenue, Suite 800 Tampa, Florida 33602 (813) 258-4747

Roxane incorporates by reference all additional Plaintiff and third party witnesses identified on pp. 6-77 of Defendant Dey's Second Supplemental Initial Disclosures (attached hereto as Exhibit A), and additionally identifies the following person(s):

HHS - OIG

William Shrigley

(Current address unknown)

Roxane further incorporates by reference any additional persons identified in the Rule 26 disclosures of any other party to this action, including those persons identified in any Rule 26 disclosures filed by Defendants Abbott and Dey in both their federal actions and the California State AWP litigation. Roxane's identification of individuals in this Response shall not be construed as an admission by Roxane that any information possessed by such individuals is relevant to or admissible in this litigation. This Response is not a waiver of any objections that Roxane may have.

(B) A copy of, or a description by category and location of, all documents, data compilations, and tangible things that are in the possession, custody, or control of the party and that the disclosing party may use to support its claims or defenses, unless solely for impeachment.

RESPONSE:

Roxane's investigation into the facts and circumstances surrounding this action is not yet complete. Roxane anticipates that it will discover additional documents in the course of its further investigation and via discovery in this case and other AWP cases. Accordingly, Roxane reserves the right to use such additional documents, as well as any other documents listed in the Rule 26 disclosures of the other parties to this action, in connection with these proceedings and at trial. Roxane further reserves the right to supplement or amend this Response as appropriate and to the extent required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Subject to the foregoing, Roxane herein sets forth a description by category of documents, data compilations, and tangible

things that it has or controls, and of which it is aware at this time, that it may use to support its claims or defenses in this matter:

| Document Category | Location(s) |
|---|---|
| 1. Communications between Roxane and independent pricing compendia publishers regarding their practices and procedures and the pricing and/or listing of Azathioprine (NDC 00054408425), Diclofenac Sodium (NDC 00054422125, 00054422225), Furosemide (NDC 00054329446, 00054329450, 00054429725, 00054829725, 00054429731, 00054429925, 00054829925, 00054429931, 00054430125, 00054830125, 00054430129), Hydromorphone (NDC 00054439225, 00054439425), Ipratropium Bromide (NDC 00054840211, 00054840213, 00054840221, 00054840411, 00054840413, 00054840421), Oramorph SR (NDC 00054479025, 00054480519, 00054480525, 00054480527, 00054479225, 00054479325), Roxanol (NDC 00054375144, 00054375150, 00054375158), Roxicodone (NDC 00054465825, 00054466525) and | Kirkland & Ellis LLP 200 E. Randolph Drive Chicago, IL 60601 On information and belief, the respective pricing compendia publishers may also have copies of these documents. |
| Sodium Polystyrene O/S (NDC 00054380563, 00054881611). ² | |

Roxane reserves the right to limit its production of documents should any of the drugs or NDCs listed above and below be dismissed or otherwise removed from the case.

| Document Category | Location(s) |
|---|---------------------------------------|
| 2. Communications between Roxane and the Centers for | Kirkland & Ellis LLP |
| Medicare & Medicaid Services ("CMS"), agents of | 200 E. Randolph Drive |
| CMS, and/or other federal or state agencies, offices, and | Chicago, IL 60601 |
| departments regarding the pricing, pricing benchmarks, | |
| rebates, supplemental rebates, and/or reimbursement of | On information and belief, copies of |
| Azathioprine (NDC 00054408425), Diclofenac Sodium | these documents can also be found |
| (NDC 00054422125, 00054422225), Furosemide (NDC | with the applicable federal agencies, |
| 00054329446, 00054329450, 00054429725, | including, but not limited to: |
| 00054829725, 00054429731, 00054429925, | β, τ |
| 00054829925, 00054429931, 00054430125, | Centers for Medicare & Medicaid |
| 00054830125, 00054430129), Hydromorphone (NDC | Services |
| 00054439225, 00054439425), Ipratropium Bromide | 7111 Security Boulevard |
| (NDC 00054840211, 00054840213, 00054840221, | Baltimore, MD 21244 |
| 00054840411, 00054840413, 00054840421), Oramorph | |
| SR (NDC 00054479025, 00054480519, 00054480525, | |
| 00054480527, 00054479225, 00054479325), Roxanol | |
| (NDC 00054375144, 00054375150, 00054375158), | |
| Roxicodone (NDC 00054465825, 00054466525) and | |
| Sodium Polystyrene O/S (NDC 00054380563, | |
| 00054881611). | |
| 3. Communications between Roxane and federal and | Kirkland & Ellis LLP |
| state purchasers regarding the pricing of or rebates for | 200 E. Randolph Drive |
| Azathioprine (NDC 00054408425), Diclofenac Sodium | Chicago, IL 60601 |
| (NDC 00054422125, 00054422225), Furosemide (NDC | |
| 00054329446, 00054329450, 00054429725, | On information and belief, copies of |
| 00054829725, 00054429731, 00054429925, | these documents can also be found |
| 00054829925, 00054429931, 00054430125, | with the applicable federal and state |
| 00054830125, 00054430129), Hydromorphone (NDC | departments and subdivisions, |
| 00054439225, 00054439425), Ipratropium Bromide | including, but not limited to: |
| (NDC 00054840211, 00054840213, 00054840221, | _ |
| 00054840411, 00054840413, 00054840421), Oramorph | Military Health System |
| SR (NDC 00054479025, 00054480519, 00054480525, | The Pentagon |
| 00054480527, 00054479225, 00054479325), Roxanol | Washington, D.C. 20301-1200 |
| (NDC 00054375144, 00054375150, 00054375158), | |
| Roxicodone (NDC 00054465825, 00054466525) and | Veterans Health Administration |
| Sodium Polystyrene O/S (NDC 00054380563, | 810 Vermont Ave. NW |
| 00054881611). | Washington, DC 20420 |
| 4. Communications between Ven-A-Care and CMS, | On information and belief, these |
| agents of CMS, and/or other federal or state agencies, | documents are in the custody and |
| offices, departments, and/or legislators, if any, regarding | control of Ven-A-Care and the |
| the pricing, pricing benchmarks, and/or reimbursement | Government. |
| for pharmaceutical products. | |

| Document Category | Location(s) |
|--|--|
| 5. Publicly-available reports that did alert or should have alerted the federal and state governments that figures reported to it by First Data Bank and other third party pricing compendia did not reflect the acquisition costs of drugs for health care providers. <i>See, e.g.,</i> Medicare Action Transmittal No. 84-12, reprinted in Medicare and Medicaid Guide (CCH) § 34,157 at 2 (1984); various Office of the Inspector General reports from 1984 onward addressing Medicare and Medicaid payments for prescription drugs; Bill Alpert, <i>Hooked on Drugs,</i> Barron's, Vol. LXXVI, June 10, 1996, at 15; Spencer Rich, <i>Battling the High Prices Medicare Pays for Drugs,</i> The Washington Post, Jan. 2, 1997. | These documents are public documents that are readily available to the Government and the Relator. The majority of the reports were issued by the Office of the Inspector General or the General Accounting Office and therefore are in the custody and control of the Government. |
| 6. Roxane's Rebate Agreements entered into with the Federal Government and/or state governments. | On information and belief, these documents are in the custody and control of the Government and can be found at the following locations: Office of the Secretary U.S. Department of Health & Human Services 200 Independence Ave. S.W. Washington, D.C. 20201 Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services 7111 Security Boulevard Baltimore, MD 21244 |
| 7. For the relevant time period, Roxane's quarterly AMP filings to CMS for its products at issue in this case. 8. All documents referenced in the Memorandum filed | On information and belief, these data are in the custody and control of the Government and can be found at the following location: Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services 7111 Security Boulevard Baltimore, MD 21244 Kirkland & Ellis LLP |
| in support of Defendants' Joint Motion to Dismiss in this case, incorporated herein by reference. | 200 E. Randolph Drive Chicago, IL 60601 |

| Document Category | Location(s) |
|--|---|
| 9. The Settlement Agreement reached between Roxane and the State of Texas in the Texas AWP Litigation. | Kirkland & Ellis LLP 200 E. Randolph Drive Chicago, IL 60601 |
| | On information and belief, copies of these documents can also be found at the following location: |
| | Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. c/o James J. Breen The Breen Law Firm, P.A. 5755 Northpoint Parkway Suite 39 Alpharetta, GA 30022 |
| 10. Documents originating from the Texas AWP Litigation that demonstrate that the federal government knew of its possible claims against Roxane for most target drugs long before the Government now claims to have acquired such knowledge, including, but not limited to documents revealing that Government attorneys attended depositions of Roxane employees. | Kirkland & Ellis LLP 200 E. Randolph Drive Chicago, IL 60601 On information and belief, copies of these documents can also be found at the following location: |
| | Ven-A-Care of the Florida Keys, Inc. c/o James J. Breen The Breen Law Firm, P.A. 5755 Northpoint Parkway Suite 39 Alpharetta, GA 30022 |

Roxane specifically excludes from these Initial Disclosures, any documents protected from disclosure by the attorney-client privilege or the work-product doctrine, including, but not limited to, the following types of documents:

- 1. Documents seeking or reflecting legal advice given to Roxane by Roxane's counsel. These communications have not been voluntarily disclosed to any persons other than employees of Roxane, counsel representing Roxane, or their agents.
- 2. Documents reflecting the mental impressions of attorneys representing Roxane, or containing or reflecting work undertaken at the direction of attorneys representing Roxane. These communications have not been voluntarily disclosed

- to any persons other than employees of Roxane, counsel representing Roxane, or their agents.
- 3. Documents seeking or reflecting work product by Roxane's counsel, in connection with pending or anticipated litigation involving allegations similar to those in this case. These communications have not been voluntarily disclosed to any persons other than employees of Roxane, counsel representing Roxane, or their agents.

Roxane's identification of specific documents or categories of documents in this Response shall not be construed as an admission by Roxane of the existence or authenticity of such documents or categories of documents, and Roxane specifically reserves any objections that it may have as to the discoverability of such documents or categories of documents. This Response is not a waiver of any objections that Roxane may have.

(C) A computation of any category of damages claimed by the disclosing party, making available for inspection and copying as under Rule 34 the documents or other evidentiary material, not privileged or protected from disclosure, on which such computation is based, including materials bearing on the nature and extent of injuries suffered.

RESPONSE:

Roxane is not asserting a claim for damages at this time. The Government has the burden of proving damages. Roxane disputes liability and, to the extent it is necessary and appropriate, will also contest the Government's damages claim. Without limitation, Roxane denies that the Government has suffered any injury whatsoever.

(D) For inspection and copying as under Rule 34 any insurance agreement under which any person carrying on an insurance business may be liable to satisfy part or all of a judgment which may be entered in the action or to indemnify or reimburse for payments made to satisfy the judgment.

RESPONSE:

Roxane is not currently aware of any insurance agreement under which an insurance carrier will be liable to satisfy part or all of a judgment which may be entered in the action or to indemnify or reimburse for payments made to satisfy the judgment.

Dated: January 12, 2009 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Eric T. Gortner
Helen E. Witt, P.C.
Anne M. Sidrys, P.C.
Eric T. Gortner
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP
200 East Randolph Drive
Chicago, IL 60601
Telephone: (312) 861-2000
Facsimile: (312) 861-2200

egortner@kirkland.com

On hahalf of Defendants Rochringer 1

On behalf of Defendants Boehringer Ingelheim Roxane, Inc. and Roxane Laboratories, Inc.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing was delivered to all counsel of record by electronic service pursuant to Paragraph 11 of Case Management Order No. 2, by sending on January 12, 2009, a copy to LexisNexis File and Serve for posting and notification to all parties.

/s/ Eric T. Gortner Eric T. Gortner